

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

## MINUTES

**CASE CAPTION:** City of Grand Rapids v. Grand Rapids Police Command Officers Assoc, et al

**Case Number:** 1:17-cv-113

**Date:** April 17, 2019

**Time:** 9:02 a.m. – 10:36 a.m.  
11:00 a.m. – 12:05 p.m.  
1:54 p.m. – 3:03 p.m.

**Place:** Kalamazoo

**Judge:** Paul L. Maloney

### APPEARANCES

Plaintiff/Counter-Defendant: Scott E. Dwyer and Benjamin C. Dilley

Defendant Grand Rapids Police Command Officers Association: Andrew J. Gordon  
Defendant/Counter-Claimant Matthew Janiskee: Andrew J. Rodenhouse and Charles C. Newberg

### PROCEEDINGS

Nature of Hearing: Bench Trial – Day 3: continuation of Plaintiff's presentation of evidence; Plaintiff rests; Defendant/Counter-Claimant Janiskee's presentation of evidence; Defendant/Counter-Claimant Janiskee rests; Defendant GR Police Command Officers Association rests; closing arguments by all parties; case taken under advisement, opinion and order to issue

### WITNESSES:

Timothy Becker, Matthew Janiskee, Michael Maycroft

### EXHIBITS:

Description	Admitted
Plaintiff/Counter-Defendant's Exhibits: (none)	
Defendant GRPCOA's Exhibits: D	Yes
Defendant/Counter-Claimant Janiskee's Exhibits: (none)	

Court Reporter: Kathleen Thomas

Case Manager: Amy Redmond